

MINUTES
City Vehicle Accident Review Board
March 5th, 2013
City Council Conference Room
Wayne Gilley City Hall
1:30 pm

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Wright at 1:55 pm.

1. Roll Call

MEMBERS PRESENT: Rusty Wright, Chairman
Dennis Bothell, Equipment Maintenance
Candy Brown, Safety & Risk Manager
Carl Dentler, Public Works Safety & Risk Officer

MEMBERS ABSENT: None

OTHERS PRESENT: Tiffani Burk, HR
Paul Caldwell, Safety Rep
Norman Busch, Safety Rep
Leon McGahee, Safety Rep
Bobby Finley, Safety Rep

Excused* Unexcused**

2. Minutes:

A. Approval of minutes of February 5th, 2013

Motion by Dentler with second by Brown to approve the minutes of February 5th, 2013. AYES: All NAYS: None Motion carried.

3. Old Business:

A. Ramon Ortega-Streets (11/20/12)

Mr. Ortega was present. Safety Rep Norman Busch was also present. Mr. Ortega said he has been here 19 years and he is getting points for a mailbox. He doesn't think it is right. He could understand if it was a water line or gas line or something major. A \$50.00 mailbox! He thinks it costs more to be here to have a meeting than the mailbox did. He said it was a mistake. It was not done intentionally.

Motion by Bothell with second by Brown to uphold the initial ruling as a Chargeable Collision with two (2) points assessed. AYES: All NAYS: None
Motion carried.

B. Richard Baxter-SWC (12/28/12)

Mr. Baxter was present. Safety Rep Paul Caldwell was also present. Mr. Baxter said when we had the ice storm and bad weather. The gentleman that he was with was Mr. Ervin. Mr. Baxter said I got out of the truck, I told him to back up. He hit the ice and fish tailed. I told the driver to move up a little bit and come on the left side a little bit more. The driver slid again and hit the plastic phone box. He said I was out of the truck when I backed the driver up. Carl asked Mr. Baxter if he voluntarily got out of the truck. He said yes. Mr. Baxter said his normal driver goes inside the parking lot of the Comanche Nation Funeral Home. He goes all the way to the end and turns around and goes back out the same way. He said I told Mr. Ervin to back up away from the phone box and that is when he hit it. He hit the patch of ice. Candy asked him where he was standing. He said I was on the right hand side. He said it was very cold that day. He said the driver hit the ice twice. Candy asked him if anyone else was in the truck. He said Donald Holmes was also in the truck. Candy said so he could attest that you got out of the truck. Mr. Baxter said that Mr. Holmes said that I did not get out of the truck, but I did get out of the truck. Paul said looking at the pictures he was too close to the curb to start with. Candy asked him did you tell him that he was too close to the curb. Mr. Baxter said yes I told him. He described the street and said that there was a fire hydrant across the street. He said I told the driver to stop but he kept going. He said they didn't have air horns in the truck but I had the window rolled down. Paul said if the driver would have seen you and you said he was too close then the truck should not have moved. He was a new operator and you had the experience. You should have stopped him. Mr. Baxter said I told him to stop. He said I told him to move up and come in at a different angle. He said it is hard for me to focus on a different driver. Rusty asked him how much ice was on the road. Mr. Baxter said when I was going up to the drive way it was full of ice. Candy said was it patchy? He said yes.

Motion by Bothell with second by Brown to rule this as a Chargeable Collision with two (2) points assessed. AYES: All NAYS: None Motion carried.

C. Arthur Nunley-WD (5/26/12)

Mr. Nunley was present. Bobby Finley was also present. Mr. Nunley said that day he was by himself over at the pump station loading the 10 wheeler out with old dirt and concrete. He had to extend the boom out on the 80 trackhoe. It was probably his 2nd or 3rd time on it. He was pulling in to the cab, coming up towards the blade. He had to grab a hold of a piece of concrete, it slipped off that and slipped pass the bucket and came into the cab. At that time, he did not know that the boom being extended out like that would come in that far. The fork on the end of the bucket came into the cab and punctured a hole in the cab. He was the only person there. It was on a weekend.

Motion by Bothell with a second by Dentler to rule this as a Chargeable Damage Incident but reduce it to zero (0) points assessed. AYES: All NAYS: None Motion Carried.

Due to this accident happening, the Board recommends to Water Distribution that they make sure the operators that are driving the trackhoes have sufficient and proper training before they are put on a trackhoe. This accident could have resulted in an operator injury also.

D. Arthur Nunley-WD (12/10/12)

Mr. Nunley was present. Bobby Finley was also present. Mr. Nunley said he did his usual walk around on the truck. He checked the fluids. He got in but couldn't pull forward because another truck and trailer was parked in front of him. So he went to back out. When he did, he overcompensated and hit the corner of the trailer with the front bumper. He provided additional pictures of the yard. He said sometimes things are not put back or parked back in their proper place. People should be made to park things where they are supposed to be parked. Things like that are just setting us up for failure. He said he takes full responsibility for what he did. He said he is trying to prevent it from happening to anyone else. He was backing straight out and then turned the wheel and his bumper caught the trailer. He almost didn't feel it because the 10 wheeler is a lot bigger than the trailer. Dennis asked Mr. Nunley what the maximum distance the city policy allows you to back a vehicle. Mr. Nunley said he did not know. Dennis told him to go ask his supervisor. Mr. Nunley said he would.

Motion by Bothell with second by Brown to rule this as a Chargeable Collision with two (2) points assessed. AYES: All NAYS: None Motion carried.

E. Bill Herndon-Bldg. Maint. (11/17/12)

Mr. Herndon was present. Safety Rep Leon McGahee was also present. Mr. Herndon said he was towing a trailer. He said he thinks there was something wrong with the hitch. That hitch won't latch unless it is on the ball right. He said he checked it good and it was latched. Chains were hooked and the lights were on. He hit a bump and it popped right off. He said we had it happen a couple of years ago to a guy in parks and it was the same type of trailer. He said maybe it was the same trailer. When he stopped and got out to put the trailer back on the hitch, it was still locked down. He had to unlock it and take the pin out to put it back on. It was a 2" ball and a 2" hitch. Dennis asked if the chains caught it and Mr. Herndon said yes. The light is what actually hit the tailgate.

Motion by Bothell with second by Wright to rule this as Non-Preventable with zero (0) points assessed. AYES: All NAYS: None Motion carried.

4. New Business:

A. George Cheatham- Parks & Grounds (2/4/13)

Mr. Cheatham was present. Safety Rep Leon McGahee was also present. Mr. Cheatham said he was going westbound to another project. He was at a stoplight. He looked up to chain lanes as he went through the light, looked off and when he looked back up the vehicle in front of him had stopped. He was on his brakes but couldn't stop from hitting her. They did call the paramedics.

Motion by Bothell with second by Wright to rule this as a Chargeable Collision with three (3) points assessed. AYES: All NAYS: None Motion carried.

B. Brian Unroe- Parks & Grounds (2/1/13)

Mr. Unroe was present. Safety Rep Leon McGahee was also present. Mr. Unroe said Friday afternoon everything was fine. Then on Monday morning someone brought it to his attention that the license plate on the front bumper of unit 5201 was on the ground. He was the last person to drive it on Friday. The front bumper was dented. He said it was not like that when he left Friday. It had to have happened on the weekend. He said they were cleaning around the vehicles Friday afternoon and it was not like that then.

Motion by Bothell with second by Brown to rule this as a Non-Preventable with zero (0) points assessed. AYES: All NAYS: None Motion carried.

C. Ismael Garcia-SWC (1/16/13)

Mr. Garcia was not present. Safety Rep Paul Caldwell was present. Mr. Garcia is no longer a City of Lawton employee. Mr. Garcia was pulling a dumpster towards the truck with the wench because it was against a concrete wall that was already broken. The corner of the dumpster pushed against the wall slightly and the wall fell over. This was at Church's Chicken. Paul said Mr. Garcia said the wall was ready to fall over anyway.

Motion by Bothell with second by Caldwell to rule this as a Chargeable Damage Incident with one (1) point assessed. AYES: All NAYS: None Motion carried.

5. Consider any other injuries reported: None
6. Communication/Discussion: None
7. Adjournment: Motion by Bothell with second by Wright to adjourn meeting at 3:20 pm.